

CITY COUNCIL REPORT

Public

DATE: January 28, 2019

TO: Mayor and Councilmembers

FROM: Interim Chief Dan Musselman, Fire Chief Mark Gaillard

CC: City Manager Barbara Goodrich, Interim Deputy City Manager Kevin Treadway, Deputy City Manager Shane Dille and Leadership Team

SUBJECT: Impacts of Student Housing on the Police and Fire Departments

This is in response to a request from Council for information regarding call loads at student housing complexes.

DISCUSSION:

Several new student housing projects are being developed which will bring additional residents into our community. Some of these units are not necessarily designated as student housing, however they are closer to the university and will likely have a high ratio of student residents. These young residents are some of the more frequent users of police services. Some of these larger developments include:

McGrath (224 units, 850 beds, Butler and Sawmill Road)
The Standard (248 units, 763 beds, 824 W. Route 66)
Trailside (120 Units, Unknown beds, 600 W. University Heights Drive North)
Mill Town (381 units, 1201 beds, Milton and University)
Aura Flagstaff (173 units, 700 beds, 3401 S. Lake Mary Road)
Uncommon Flagstaff (195 units, 609 beds, 910 S. Milton Road)
Liv+ Flagstaff (159 units, 701 beds, JW Powell & Lone Tree)
Apartments at Lone Tree and Pine Knoll (188 units, unknown beds)

RECENT FLAGSTAFF POLICE DATA:

We ran 2018 calls for service at four various multi-housing units that are further away from the university to try and establish a baseline of calls for service per bed. The ratio of calls for service per bed at these properties was calculated out as follows:

- Elevation Apartments, 5000, N. Mall Way, calculated at .17 calls per bed per year
- Country Club Vista Apartments, 5250 E. Cortland Blvd., .24 calls per bed per year
- Greenlaw Apartments, 2600 E. Seventh Ave., calculated at .13 calls per year per bed
- Butterfield Apartments, 4015 E. Soliere Ave., calculated at .31 calls per bed per year.

The four complexes when averaged together resulted in an average call load of .22 calls per bed per year.

We then looked closely at the Police Department call load calculations at three recently developed student housing complexes. These complexes have a large number of beds and are within walking distance of Campus. We looked at the Grove complex which opened in August of 2012 and has 776 beds in 10 apartment buildings and 54 townhomes. A five-year audit of police calls at the Grove showed an average call load of .41 per bed, per year. It appears to be tapering down a little over the last three years, from a high of 420 calls in 2014 to 234 calls in 2017.

We also looked at the Fremont Station, which we were told has a total of 232 units, including one bedroom (17 units), two-bedroom (18 units), four-bedroom (157 units), and five-bedroom (40 units). The 232 total units account for 881 beds. The Fremont Station opened in August of 2017. We reviewed 12 months of call data from August of 2017 through August of 2018. Flagstaff Police responded to a total of 242 calls during the year for an average of .27 calls per bed per year.

We also looked at the HUB, which is the most recently developed complex, which contains 591 beds. They recently opened in August of 2018, and we were able to determine they had 29 calls from August through the end of October, a three-month period. It is projected they will end up with approximately 116 calls for the year, which calculates out to .20 calls per bed per year.

If we average out the calls per bed per year from the three complexes, we get a figure of .29 calls per bed per year. On average it takes one officer about one hour to respond to, investigate and complete a report or notes on a call. The rough burden rate per officer per hour is about \$100.

For example, the McGrath Development at Butler and Sawmill is being designed for 850 beds. The calculation of $850 \times .29$ equals approximately 246.5 calls per year at the complex. A rough expense to the City would be \$24,650 in police services per year. The call loads typically begin to taper off after about three years, as more permanent residents stay and less tenants are made up of freshman and sophomore students. We also see

a drop off on calls for service when good Crime Free Multi-Housing management practices are utilized.

FIRE DEPARTMENT IMPACTS:

Fire Department Impacts of student housing and multi-floor construction not limited to student housing are evaluated in two areas: demand and risk.

Demand:

Following the methodology employed in the previous section analyzing Police impacts, here is the data related to the Flagstaff Fire Department in a mirrored format.

We also looked at the Grove complex which opened in August of 2012 and has 776 beds in 10 apartment buildings and 54 townhomes. A five-year audit of Fire/EMS calls at the Grove showed an average call load of .05 per bed, per year. We also noted calls tapering down a little over the last three years, from a high of 68 calls in 2014 to 47 calls in 2017.

We looked at the Fremont Station, which has a total of 232 units which account for 881 beds. The Fremont Station opened in August of 2017. We reviewed 12 months of call data from August of 2017 through August of 2018. Flagstaff Fire responded to a total of 54 calls during the year for an average of .06 calls per bed per year.

Finally, we looked at the HUB, which is the most recently developed complex, which contains 591 beds. They recently opened in August of 2018, and we were able to determine they had 16 calls from September through the end of December, a four-month period. It is projected they will end up with approximately 48 calls for the year, which calculates out to .08 calls per bed per year.

If we average out the calls per bed per year from the three complexes, we get a figure of .06 calls per bed per year. On average it takes one Engine company about one hour to respond to, investigate/treat, remove the patient and complete a report or notes on a call. The rough burden rate for a 3-person Engine is about \$205 per hour.

Continuing to work with the Police model; the McGrath Development at Butler and Sawmill is being designed for 850 beds. The calculation of $850 \times .06$ equals approximately 51 calls per year at the complex. A rough expense to the City would be \$10,455 in Fire/EMS services per year.

To take this further we have seen sixty-one (61) new facilities that are over 3 stories go up in the City. These facilities represent a significant change in higher density with elevated logistical and manpower needs. Consider accessing, treating and moving a non-mobile EMS patient from a room on the ground floor to the ambulance v. having them on the third floor or above. Or, engaging in firefighting tactics on the ground floor level v. three stories or higher.

While not all these facilities are strictly student housing, the FFD also projects that based on a % of all calls that the FFD responds to on a given year, 25% are directly related to NAU students (on campus, off campus housing and downtown activities).

Risk:

In the last five years approximately 60 buildings have been developed that are 3 stories and higher. Twenty-three of which are four or more stories and requiring standpipe installations. The resulting change of risk (high risk) building occupancy has challenged the Fire Department in terms of equipping for initial response to these types of building. To provide adequate coverage and protect current ISO classification the City requires a minimum of two aerial devices (with a reserve) distributed across the city. Currently, we co-staff one quint from Station #2. with a reserve quint also located there. These aerial apparatuses are aging, frequently inoperable and require replacement. One of them is being partially refurbished to extend its life. Once completed, we will co-staff both units from St #1 and St #3 for better coverage and attempt to prolong their response lives. The projected cost of a new quint to replace existing units is estimated at \$1,250,000 per unit.

The Fire Department workplan includes the completion of a Community Risk Analysis and Standards of Cover analysis which will be used to identify gaps in our current capability and support development impact fee recommendations and future capital and staffing planning. We anticipate a 9-month project commencing on or about July 1, 2019.

This report is for information only.